

**NMSU Diversity Council Meeting Minutes**  
**Wednesday, November 14, 2018**  
**Room 85 Milton Hall**  
**1:30 pm – 2:30 pm**

I. **Call to Order:**

Meeting was called to order at 1:32 pm by the Chair of Diversity Council Laura Gutierrez-Spencer

- II. **MEMBERS PRESENT:** Michael Ray – American Indian Programs, Laura Gutierrez-Spencer – Chicano Programs/Diversity Council Chair, Carol Flinchbaugh – College of Business/Diversity Council Chair-Elect, Hector Sanchez – Military and Veteran’s Programs, Abby Nayra – Honors’ College, Festus Addo-Yobo – Black Programs, Ivelisse Torres Fernandez – College of Education, Catherine Jonet – College of Arts and Sciences, Shadai Martin – Faculty Senate, Rebecca Silva – NMSU Carlsbad, Mariaelena De La Rosa – University Library, Fermin Rubio – Office of Institutional Equity, Emily Creegan – Graduate Student Council, Stephanie Lynch- College of Health and Social Sciences, Trudy Luken-Student Accessibility Services, Maria Rocha-Hall – Athletics, Dulcinea Lara – Hispanic Faculty Staff Caucus, Keith Mandabach – Employee Council, Juan Garcia – NMSU: Alamogordo, Luis Vazquez - VP Research Office, Dinoliz Perez – LGBT+ Programs, Claudia Trueblood – Indian Resource Development Program
- III. **ABSENT:** Carol B. Hicks - Student Success, Emerson Morrow ASNMSU, John Idowu – College of ACES, Martha Estrada – CAMP, Martha Mitchell – College of Engineering, Tara Roof – NMSU Dona Ana CC, Elan Delgadillo – NMSU Grants

**GUESTS:** Chancellor Dan Arvizu, President John Floros, Interim Provost April Mason, Chancellor’s Chief of Staff Lenny Martinez

IV. **Welcome to Administration and Introductory Statement by Laura Gutiérrez-Spencer, Chair**

**Chancellor Arvizu:** Can we start with how we see our roles and our work with this important group? Thank you for taking the initiative to reach out to invite us. This is a partnership. We also want this to be an on-going relationship is. Everything we do is about diversity, inclusion, and creating a culture where diversity is part of everything we do. For me in running large R&D organizations, it is like safety. If we have a separate safety office and people feel that it is that office’s job to do safety, your are going to be in real trouble. Safety is everyone’s job. If anyone sees something that isn’t right, they need to speak up. This is a principal value. You don’t need to convince me of the importance of diversity. On the other hand, there are big challenges. Our institution’s responsibility is to serve the underserved. This is at the core of the Land Grant mission. I would like to think that our faculty and staff would be as diverse as the population that we serve. But we aren’t. I welcome that there are different points of view. We have not made as much progress as I think we should. I view Diversity Council as a partner who can provide us with wise insights, council insights and ideas. You can help us figure out how to do something that we have not figured out how to do. We have not made progress for a reason. We need to understand those reasons.

**President Floros:** We are here to work with you. When we made the announcement about reorganizing the structure of the university, one of the positions we announced was a Chief Diversity Officer. This is something that we were surprised that this institution did not have. We understand that diversity is everyone’s job. But we also need to have something in place to help us understand what it means to have us move toward certain goals and directions. This is a very diverse state and institution. It is one of the reasons that I decided to come here. Our 55% Hispanic students, Native American , African American, LGBT, men and

women, when they look up, they don't necessarily see themselves represented in the faculty and administration. We would like to make an effort to change that. Your opinions on how to do that will be very important. Money is not growing on trees. We are going to figure out how to do things without a lot of money, or if it does take money, how to invest it. Many things we can do are not financially burdensome. That person, will put together some things that will help our institution make progress. I want you to view this as one of many meetings, where we put our heads together.

**Chancellor:** I hope you will see as time goes by, that we really mean it.

**Interim Provost Mason:** I am very happy to be here and to be part of these discussions. I see my goal as forming a basis for the next Provost.

**Question # 1: Festus Addo-Yobo - What is your definition of Diversity?**

**Chancellor:** Diversity includes abilities, experiences, cultures, orientation, income. As broad a definition as it can have. It seems congruent with your questions to us. Any problem is best addressed by multiple points of view. A culture shift is required. How do we examine our own biases? We don't have all the answers

**President:** Can we ask a question? What do we want to accomplish here? I mean we want to answer your questions, but we also want to hear from you.

**Laura Gutierrez-Spencer:** Actually, if I can say, that we have some urgent administrative topics to cover that involve how we will function. Also, we have worked for months to prepare for this meeting. If there is time after these questions are covered, then we can have a wider discussion.

**Chancellor:** Ok, we will answer your questions.

**Question #2: Hector Sanchez - Since we are a System Diversity Council, to whom shall we report, the Chancellor or the President? Or will we report to and interact with both?**

**Chancellor:** This is a system wide and we will address it as such. If things are systems wide, it will typically be a Chancellor responsibility. If it focuses primarily on the LC, campus, then it will rest with the President. There will be some overlap. If something is of high degree of urgency or of strategic profile, then it will fit in the Chancellor's Office. But we have Faculty Senate, Employee council, they meet with the both of us. I see this as no different. Some of the things at the system level that John is good at, he will do that. Issues relating to energy on the LC campus, he will let me work on most of that. As a rule, you will both report to the system. All of us care about diversity and inclusion. You will meet with both of us. When one of us cannot attend one of us with speak for the both of us. That way you will have 2 chance to meet with one of us and we can both come, we can.

**A) How often does the administration plan to meet with us?**

**Chancellor:** I think that is more indicative of how urgent the issues are. If it is quarterly. You tell us, which is more important. I will commit on whatever regular interval. If you get to a point where you have some initiatives that you want to propose, we will be here. I will also commit to some kind of regularity.

**President:** When you talk to one of us, it is like talking to the other. We want to be responsive, no matter what. I want to suggest that we meet once a semester, regularly. I also want to suggest that we meet in addition to that, as circumstances dictate. If there is something that we want your guidance on, or you may want to meet with us. I meet with other groups. The bottom line is that we want to have some regularity so that at least one of us (Chancellor, President or Provost) are here to listen to you, and convey what we need to convey. Beyond that, we can schedule more.

**Question #3: Keith Mandabach:** The previous administration made a number of high-level appointments with no search, and yet later directed all departments to follow EEO guidelines for non-discrimination in hiring. We understand that the administration has some leeway in making their staff appointments, however it is difficult to establish a culture of fairness in hiring if the administration does not also model this practice. **What will your administration's policy be for filling positions at the level of Dean, Vice Presidents, and executive staff positions? Actually, it goes beyond that, basically, the policy on filling positions overall.**

**Chancellor:** Great question. I am not a big fan of quotas, prescriptions. They are not successful. Often with them, you are not successful in increasing diversity. Previously, as a manager of organizations of more than 3,000 employees, I could not leave it to my managers, that they would always have diverse candidates. When you have very sparse hiring. Sparse hiring means that in one unit, you have one opening. In another unit, you have another opening. When you leave it entirely to the managers they get a person from the university that they went to or they hire someone that they knew. And they hire someone just like themselves. You have to take a proactive stance. That was the way I was promoted. Our organization said "we have a diversity challenge among ourselves". When we have 4 positions open in different spaces, you cannot leave it open to a sub-optimized approach. When they had 4 positions open, they said "we have to make at least one of the 4 be of a gender of color, etc. in order to create more diversity. " Sometimes you have to move things around to open up opportunities, without sacrificing quality. The quota stuff does not work. We need to think about it in a broader perspective. We are committed to the outcome. I marvel when sometimes we name an interim position, people get upset. We hope you will judge us on our actions, and not our process.

**Laura Gutierrez-Spencer:** We do not have a history of quotas. If I can reframe the question a bit, we have seen announcements that a certain person has been named by the administration to a high-level position, and some folks wish that they had the opportunity to apply and compete for that position. They didn't know that there was an opportunity. We have also had the situation where two individuals have competed for a VP position that was separated into two separate jobs. Two individuals were the 2<sup>nd</sup> in command under that VP who left, one was a white person, and the other was Hispanic, The white person was given the full time position, with no search. The person of color had to compete in a national search. When she prevailed in the national search and was eventually selected to be promoted to the newly divided VP position, she was not allowed to replace herself in her former position. **This was seen as clearly unfair. So, to reframe the question, when we are told to follow EEO procedures and allow open competition for positions, will we see your administration doing the same?**

**President:** the answer to that is "yes."

**Question #4: Michael Ray - Given the current budget constraints, is the administration still planning to hire a Vice Provost for Diversity and Inclusion? And if so, is there a timeline for this hire?**

**President:** We still don't know what the future economic climate will be. For this fiscal year, we are going to struggle to make ends meet. Next fiscal year, our hope is that the situation will look better.

**President:** Our first priority is to increase the I&G line. If we can do that, we will be in really good shape. Our second priority is compensation. We need to increase salaries. We know a lot of people have suffered. We don't know what our next move is because we don't know what the next fiscal year will look like until the legislature meets. If next fiscal year looks any better than this fiscal year, then that position will come along the next fiscal year. So, we haven't answered your question because we don't know what resources we will have.

**A) In the case that the Vice Provost for Diversity and Inclusion position is to be filled, in an effort to support our administration in this effort, we would like to offer our expertise and experience in diversity to this effort. We hope to contribute to the development of the job description and have some members participate in the search itself. Do you envision some members of Diversity Council being named to serve on the search committee for this position?**

**President:** The answer is yes, particularly if you are not going to be a candidate. I would suggest that you start working on the job description now.

**Question #4 follow-up Questions - Trudy Luken - Since the VP for Diversity and Inclusion is intended to work at a system-level this individual will need sufficient authority within our administration to be effective. We wonder if there has been consideration of naming this position "Vice Chancellor" instead of "Vice Provost."**

**Michael Ray:** As you have noticed, we have prefaced a lot of our questions with a statement. We offer our expertise..., experience when it comes to the job description. Some members would be willing to serve the search itself. We hope it would be a number of people from Diversity Council, as we don't want one person to be Atlas and become the weight bearer for all of diversity, since we all have areas of expertise. We offered a job description and a proposal on how to set up the CDO Office before, in view of the fact that we have diversity issues at all the campuses. We need to look at it at a system-wide level. We have offered that we see this as more as a Vice/Chancellor position that will work with all of our campuses, and look at our system-wide issues. We don't need to create smaller pockets of what we already are.

**President:** In my mind, it is not important, the exact title. I will tell you why we made this decision Our student population is diverse. Where we are suffering in in our lack diversity of faculty and staff, particularly in certain positions. That person will drive our efforts in hiring of faculty and staff. The other part that is equally important. What do we do to facilitate this process of inclusion throughout this campus? What do we do to educate not only our students, our faculty, our staff? How to discuss things when we come from different points of view? How do we become a more accepting society, within the realms of our university? I don't have an issue with it being a vice chancellor. The majority of faculty and staff are on this campus. The majority of them and students are here. I think it makes more sense to start there. There are other examples, like HR that covers the whole system.

**Chancellor:** I just had a meeting with a community college in Gallup. The Higher Education Department finds that UNM, NMSU, etc., do not gain efficiencies from being a system. The idea that we have a centralized function that is implemented in in these campuses. It has been recommended that all the money for the community colleges would be channeled through main campuses. That idea comes with unintended consequences. It's not a good idea because we have legislators who champion NMSU from all across NM. Everyone of our campuses are very different. We want to have a centralized inclusion, and satellite functions on each of our campuses. They are providing a service to each of the campuses. We are thinking of it as an enterprise.

**Michael Ray:** There is also the modifier in terms of authority. A Vice Chancellor is seen as having more authority.

**Michael Ray:** If we do hire an executive in charge of Diversity, this council desires to work collaboratively with this individual. An important role of the NMSU Diversity Council is to listen to the voices of our constituencies and bring their needs and concerns to upper administration, including the new administrator for Diversity and Inclusion. We recommend that The Diversity Council will not report directly to the individual in charge of Diversity and Inclusion but that we work collaboratively.

**This individual could serve as an ex-officio member of the NMSU System Diversity Council. Do you concur with this proposed relationship with the new executive and this council?**

**Chancellor:** I am in agreement

**President: I have a question This is an advisory body, correct? Wouldn't you want to be talking to the Chief Diversity Officer (CDO)?"**

**Michael Ray:** Yes, we want to talk to them when they have a certain authority. , but we also want to talk to you all. We would like to have them on our committee, but as an ex-officio member, so they we can have dialogue. We want to repeat what the chancellor said in that we don't want our entire campus leaning just on the CDO for dealing with diversity and inclusion issues. We need as much plurality of voices as possible with the sovereignty and authority to express the view of the under-represented.

**Laura Gutiérrez-Spencer:** This is important not only for your administration, but for subsequent administrations. We have had authoritarian administrations in the past. Going back to the chancellor's example of people referring all safety issues to the safety person. So that Diversity Council has that authority to speak to the administration. If the CDO is seen as our boss, we think that could be a damper to those voices.

**President:** What I would like to see is that you work well and in harmony with that CDO. That you play your role as an advisory council and you advice that CDO on lots of things. You are right, the decisions are being made here (administration) If things are not going well to the CDO, you always have the right to come talk to us (the administration.) If people feel that something is not going well, I want to hear about it. I am not going to say that I am going to ignore what the CDO says. I want to hear what you have to say and to work with the CDO. It is my hope that most of the time, you will work things out. If not, they we will make those decisions

**Chancellor:** Does that satisfy what you are after? John and I regularly meet with the Chair and the Vice Chair of the Faculty Senate. I don't know that they report to the provost. This is a little bit of a parallel situation. I am sure that they speak with the Provost. And they have their own independent thing

**President:** This is a little different. They (the Faculty Senate) are their own independent thing. They have their own faculty have their own, they elect. A lot of these people are appointed.

**Laura Gutiérrez-Spencer** - If I can say, we are the voices of our constituencies, if we are elected or not. A number of us are elected. The Diversity Officers spent a lot of time working on this topic We studied this topic over a year and half ago. There are a lot of different ways that this can be configured. With both the Diversity Council and the Diversity Directors, I would hope that we can discuss this further. And we don't want what you said, could happen, that the administration always turns to the CDO. There are some important subtleties. In

this US culture, efficiency is a very important value and that is great. But that can also get in the way of diversity in these power issues.

**Chancellor:** Just know that we are open to the discussion. I am a fan of best practices. In the best world we are all harmonious, but that does not always happen. So we will take in under advisement. We are open to suggestions.

**Provost:** In my previous institution. We went out and looked at other models. What we say is that there is no model. Every institution has their own way of doing it. There is no prescription for that.

**Laura Gutierrez-Spencer:** You will see that we took off the question about not having NMSU data regarding our LGBT population. Since our last meeting the issue has been addressed.

**Dinoliz Perez:** Dr. Pook met with Seth Miner and Dr. Scott because we don't have a way of doing data capture for the LGBT population. The new Banner 9 is out; they have plans to include optional LGBT questions to the online admissions application, for the first time.

**President:** There are a number of data points that we don't have because we don't ask the question. Like the number of first generation students.

**Question #6 Rebecca Silva - Our council has heard concerns about the lack of written policy and procedures made available to faculty and staff both at our branch campuses and the Las Cruces campus. Are you interested in looking into this topic at each campus? Can this topic be included in mandatory online trainings? Please share plans for addressing this concern.**

**Provost:** Are you talking about the ARP? Some things are well written. Yesterday I was told, "Oh that's what is in the ARP, but we don't do things that way."

**Rebecca Silva:** I am the business manager at Carlsbad. When we are told, that a policy or procedure has been changed, it is well after the fact. Often we submit something, and then we are told that we followed the incorrect procedure, and we didn't know. For example, I met with the DACC committee and they are going to roll out the Aggie Service Center for us. They used a lot of main campus colleges as a pilot. But there hasn't been a training to my knowledge, they didn't use us as a pilot, to see if it was working for us at the community colleges. We are being left to be outsiders to the changes that are going to be implemented. Within your administration, we would like to know if this is something that you can focus on to improve.

**Chancellor:** We do have a process for potential policy changes. Part of it is we look at who needs to see this before it becomes part of the process. It go through multiple cycles. It is a rigorous process and we thought that everyone was being included before changes happened. Policies do apply to everyone. You are alerting us to the fact that the community colleges are being left out of the loop. That is something that we didn't know about, that you brought to our attention.

**President:** There is a very involved process to make any changes. There is a procedure part of this is that everything goes through the UAC. Part of that group, the community college presidents, the deans, etc. What you are telling me suggests, is that through the leadership is told, it does not filter down. We are working on a way to communicate important parts of policy, decisions, etc. From the top down and top parallel. We are trying to come up with a solution.

**Michael Ray:** When we have worked with some of the other campuses, there is a frustration, and they will look at the main campus as a guide. And they are told that they don't do it that way. And sometimes, the way that they need to do it (the community colleges), needs to be uniquely theirs. It needs to be different because there are a many fewer offices at the community colleges.

**Laura Gutierrez-Spencer:** Also, sometimes an individual at the community colleges is told to do things a certain way, and it does not make sense, or is scary or seems wrong. The individual asks, "Can you show me that in writing?" They are not given anything in writing. So, then perhaps they contact someone at the main campus, or they find the policy online from NMSU. When that individual shows the written NMSU policy back at the branch campus, they get in trouble. They are told, "You are not supposed to contact main campus or look up main campus policy." We have come fiefdoms here.

**President:** Now you are talking about a little different issue. And that does not only happen at the branch campuses, that happens on main campus as well.

**Laura Gutierrez-Spencer:** Actually, that came up at our last meeting.

**Juan Garcia:** When Admissions (Alamogordo) reported to me for 5-6 yrs., our 30 to 40 yr old students were coming back to study . We were asking them for their high school transcripts again, when we already had collected them years ago. These older students were annoyed and complained. I called main campus Admissions and they said, "We changed that policy. We haven't done that for 10 years. The problem was I had to tell my staff that we had been doing it wrong for 10 years. It was the policy within the dept., not system-wide.

**Fermín Rubio:** We have functional area policies that are not well distributed.

**Question #7 Elán Delgadillo - For many of our students, it is the entire family that engages in the decision of where a student will attend college. For some of our underrepresented students, language is a barrier to sharing information with family members. In terms of our recruitment strategy, has there been any consideration to the development of recruitment materials and websites, in other languages that are native to our state?**

**Chancellor:** We do, in certain areas. In CAMP..

**Laura Gutierrez-Spencer:** But not Admissions.

**Chancellor:** We could probably do more. There is no prohibition. This is a complex area. There are those that believe that everything ought to be in English. Some parent's don't speak English. I don't have any personal prohibition. It is part of being culturally responsive e and meeting people where they are. I don't see it as an issue, I already see it in places.

**President:** We need to do whatever it takes to increase enrollment. We only have a limited amount of money and need to invest it in areas that will bring it in more enrollment. It may mean translating to Spanish and possibly other languages. It can also mean visiting those areas, with an individual that speaks that language, talk about what NMSU offers. We do have limited budget, Admissions has a limited budget.

**Chancellor:** We are exploring having a campus in Mexico that involves classes in English and everyone around them will not necessarily speak English. I don't see a problem being as user-friendly as possible.

**Question #8 Carol Flinchbaugh - NMSU has experienced great difficulty in the recruitment, retention, and promotion into leadership roles for women faculty and faculty of under-represented minorities, namely from African American, Mexican American/Latino and Native American groups. What will be your administration's strategy and timeline is for addressing these concerns? As part of this strategy, what will be the percentages of increases that will be expected?**

**President:** I just talked before of our expectations of the new CDO, to help us devise, to help us improve the number of underrepresented minorities, women, etc. So that the upper levels of administration and faculty look more like the population of the students. That is going to take a long time. We just don't have the students ready to move into those roles. Our minority faculty, with a lot more work and a lot more load than others. It is hard for me to sit here after just a few months in this job, to set specific goals now. This is what I would like to do with you. We are having strategic planning to go now for feedback. I would like to encourage you to give feedback on the strategic plan. We would like your feedback on that now.

Once we are done with that. I would like to have a plan to say, these are some steps that we can take to increase our representation of underrepresented faculty and administrators. We are not behind in educating women and yet we are behind in faculty representation. A lot of areas have flipped. Agriculture has flipped from male dominated to female dominated, Engineering is increasing. But other areas have not.

**President:** What is it that we need to do, to make long term, positive impact in those numbers? I know we have a long way to go to retain faculty in general, not even minorities. Within the constraints that we have, how can we make improvements? Let's work together, work with the diversity officer, to get a plan to get working on it.

**Chancellor:** The recruiting pool is thin. Those who are in this market are extremely competitive, we cannot compete. It is going to take the feeder pool to get filled out that we achieve some sort of equilibrium. What can we do to be innovative in this space, in terms of quality faculty, under- represented groups? A lot of people are at NMSU, not because the pay is good but because of institution, because of love of the community, because a lot of the attributes. We are willing to make the financial sacrifices in order to be here, because it is a compelling place to be. John and I are not smart enough to figure it out. You can teach us. We can invest in that. We can make it happen. We cannot sit back and let circumstances dictate our future if we want to make progress.

**Laura Gutierrez-Spencer:** A lot of us have been on search committees where there are applications for underutilized position, where the under-represented faculty apply and very well qualified people are dismissed, not considered. Or we hire them and they are harassed, are mistreated, and they leave, or they stay and yet they are wounded. We often are told that we cannot afford them and that is not true, in many cases. We need to talk a lot about this question. There are many tales in this room, about how that is not the fact.

**President:** That issue, particularly about women, has also come through very clearly from the leadership of the Faculty Senate.

**Question #9 Dulcinea Lara - We are enthusiastic about NMSU being home to a Borderlands and Ethnic Studies program. This program would be attractive to regional and local students, a draw for many faculty of color, particularly in the social sciences and humanities. Ethnic Studies are also a complement to NMSU's Land Grant, HSI and MSI commitments. How can your administration assist in taking this program from its current planning stage to implementation in 2019?**

**Chancellor:** Talk to Lenny (Chancellor's Chief of Staff) He has the Strategic Initiatives office We are calling this initiative "Creating Healthy Borders" If you can put it into something broader, and already working with the



Borderplex Alliance that will be working with others, I think we already have something extremely compelling. We are talking to Rod Mc Sherry and Beto Pallares. Our interest is in capitalizing a strategic asset, which is our Borderplex.

**President:** You are talking about an academic program?

**Dulcinea Lara:** Yes

**Provost:** I think that Lenny would be an excellent strategic resource. My office I would like to know what shape it is in, where it is. We had programs that went before the HED in the past month, they sailed through and are going to the Finance Committee. Let's get together to find out where the barriers have been.

**Michael Ray:** I would challenge that thought, in to not only look at our sociopolitical borders that we have in the state of New Mexico, not only our border with Mexico, but our tribal borders, our socioeconomic borders, our tribal borders as sovereign nations as well.

**Chancellor:** That is an excellent point, thank you.

#### **List of Concerns:**

**Need to break out NMSU data for African American and Native American students from what is now reported as "other minorities"**

**President:** I have asked my staff to look at that. In some cases we get to very small numbers,

**Lenny Martinez:** Strategically, I think it is an important thing to do. If you don't know what the numbers are, how can you establish a goal?

**President:** I think that regulations will not allow us to do certain things.

**Michael Ray:** When it comes to directory information, we can use that. Of course when it comes to gpa's, etc.

**President:** But if someone can decipher who an individual is, even by directory info, we are prohibited from doing that.

**Issues regarding the retention and graduation rates of minority undergraduates and graduate students.  
Status of the Minority Recruitment and Retention Fund**

**Lack of awareness of the Minority Doctoral Loan Program**

**President:** When I first saw this here, it was the first time I had heard of this. I know more about it now.

#### **Updates/Announcements**

